



Effect of pH, heat treatment and enzymes on the antifungal activity of lactic acid bacteria against *Candida* species

Bulgasem Youns Bulgasem¹, Zaiton Hassan^{1*}, Nur Huda-Faujan¹, Ramadan Hadia Ali Omar², Mohd Nizam Lani³, Mohamed Idris Alshelmani⁴

¹Food Biotechnology Programme, Faculty of Science and Technology, Universiti Sains Islam Malaysia (USIM) Bandar Baru Nilai, 71800 Nilai, Negeri Sembilan, Malaysia.

²Department of Microbiology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, Universiti Sains Islam Malaysia (USIM) Level 13, Menara B, Persiaran MPAJ, Jalan Pandan Utama, Pandan Indah, 55100 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

³School of Food Science and Technology, Universiti Malaysia Terengganu (UMT), 21030 Kuala Terengganu, Terengganu, Malaysia.

⁴Department of Animal Production, Faculty of Agriculture, University of Sebha, Libya.
Email: zaihas7272@gmail.com

Received 27 June 2016; Received in revised form 20 December 2016; Accepted 23 February 2017

ABSTRACT

Aims: The objectives of this study were to evaluate the inhibitory activity of the cell-free supernatants (CFS) of lactic acid bacteria (LAB) isolates and determine the effect of pH, enzymes and heat treatment on the antifungal activity against *Candida* species.

Methodology and results: A total of 25 strains of LAB were isolated from honey samples from Malaysia, Libya, Saudi Arabia, and Yemen. Four from twenty-five LAB isolates showed antifungal activity against *Candida* spp. and were identified as *Lactobacillus plantarum* (HS), *L. curvatus* (HH), *Pediococcus acid lactic* (HC), and *P. pentosaceus* (HM) using 16S rDNA sequence. The CFS of these isolates were evaluated for their antifungal activity using microtiter plate assay. The antifungal activity showed significant inhibitory activity against all *Candida* spp. especially growth of *C. glabrata* ATCC 2001 was significant ($p < 0.001$) completely inhibited by CFS of HH and HM at pH 3. Similarly, growth of *C. glabrata* ATCC2001 was significantly inhibited ($p < 0.001$) when treated with previously heated CFS of *L. curvatus* HH and *P. pentosaceus* HM at 90 °C and 121 °C. While, the growth of *C. krusei* ATCC 6258 was completely inhibited by CFS of *L. curvatus* HH at 121 °C. Treatment the CFS of LAB isolates with proteinase K and RNase II increased the antifungal activity against *C. krusei* and *C. glabrata*, whereas the activity of CFS produced by *P. acidilactici* was lost when treated with RNase II, especially against *C. krusei*.

Conclusion, significance and impact of study: This study demonstrated that treated supernatant of LAB isolates with heating, adjusted pH and enzymes can be used to inhibit the growth of pathogenic *Candida* spp.

Keywords: Lactic acid bacteria, antifungal activity, pathogenic *Candida* species

INTRODUCTION

Nonpathogenic Gram-positive organisms known as lactic acid bacteria or LAB are important in food product to ferment, preserve food and vitamins during food production (Rebecca *et al.*, 2008). LAB can be found in the oral cavities, gastrointestinal tracts and vaginas of humans, they are commonly used as probiotics (De Vuyst and Leroy, 2007; Eva *et al.*, 2012). Studies on LAB antifungal activity against *Candida* spp. began with (Guillot, 1958). *Lactobacillus acidophilus* created compounds that have the ability to affect *C. albicans* (Fitzsimmons and Berry, 1993). Certain strains of LAB had the capacity to inhibit growth of *Candida* spp. (Strus *et al.*, 2005). Kariptas *et al.* (2010) discovered that

Lactobacillus paracasei subsp M3 had an antifungal influence on *C. albicans*, *C. pseudointermedia* and *C. blankii*. Lavermicocca *et al.* (2003) stated that *L. plantarum* have antifungal compounds that could prevent fungi and yeast growth. *Lactobacillus plantarum* have antifungal activity was mentioned by other authors (Strom *et al.*, 2005; Sathe *et al.*, 2007; Delavenne *et al.*, 2012). Of late, Kariptas *et al.* (2010) reported that *Lactobacillus* human strains have greater antifungal activity against *C. albicans* (M29, M36), *C. parapsilosis* (M25, M26, and M44), *C. famata* (M28) and *C. guilliermondii* (M38). LAB is able in producing an assortment of antimicrobial compounds that has an significant part in preventing fungal growth due to the content of organic acids, hydrogen peroxide, carbon peroxide, diacetyl and

*Corresponding author

bacteriocins (Magnusson *et al.*, 2003; Valerio *et al.*, 2008; Gerez *et al.*, 2009; Dalié *et al.*, 2010; Muhialdin *et al.*, 2011). LAB antimicrobial compound are active in range of pH 3 to 4.5 and heat stable at 100 °C (Magnusson and Schnürer, 2001; Messens and De Vuyst, 2002; Lavermicocca *et al.*, 2003; Muhialdin *et al.*, 2011). It is necessary to search other LAB types that can inhibit the growth of pathogenic *Candida* spp. The objectives of this study were to assess the effect of pH, heat treatment and proteolytic enzymes on cell free supernatant (CFS) of LAB isolated from honey against *C. glabrata* ATCC 2001 and *C. krusei* ATCC 6258.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Honey samples

Fifteen samples of honey were collected from Malaysia (Madu Tualang, Madu Tani, and pure Trigona honey), Libya (Al-Seder honey, Al-Hanon honey and Al-Zater honey), Yemen (Al-Seder honey and Al-Maray honey), Saudi Arabic (Al-Shifaa honey) and New Zealand (Manuka honey). All samples were stored at room temperature 28 ± 2 °C prior to the analysis. pH of honey was determined using the pH meter (METTLER TOLEDO).

Isolation of lactic acid bacteria from honey samples

Isolation of LAB from honey samples succeeding the technique defined by Bulgasem *et al.* (2015). Approximately 10 g of honey samples were suspended in 90 mL peptone water (0.1% w/v) in stomacher bags and the bags were manually agitated. Then, one mL was added to nine mL of MRS broth (Oxoid CM359) and incubated at 30 °C for 48 h until the culture broth became turbid followed by serial dilution with peptone water (0.1% w/v). A 0.1 mL of appropriate dilution was spread plated on several modified media namely, MRS agar (Oxoid) (De Man *et al.*, 1960), MRS agar with 0.8% CaCO₃ (Aween *et al.*, 2012), MRS agar with 1% glucose, tomato juice agar with 0.8% CaCO₃ and tomato juice agar with 1% glucose. All plates were incubated anaerobically at 37 °C for 48 h. Isolated single colonies were tested for catalase activity with 4% H₂O₂ and were Gram stained. Catalase negative colonies were streaked on MRS agar containing 0.8% CaCO₃ incubated at 37 °C for 48 h to obtain pure colonies. All negative catalase and Gram positive LAB isolates were preserved in MRS broth with 15% of glycerol and stored at -20 °C for further analysis.

Culturing of *Candida* species

The *Candida* strains used were obtained from the original stock of the microbial collections at the Department of Medical Microbiology, University Putra Malaysia. The *Candida* spp. used in this study were *C. krusei* ATCC 6258 and *C. glabrata* ATCC 2001 and were cultured on Sabouraud Dextrose Agar (SDA, Oxoid) at 35 °C for 24 h, to 48 h to ensure viability and purity, and the fungal

strains were maintained on SDA at 4 °C until further analysis.

Cell free supernatant preparation

The isolates of LAB were inoculated into MRS broth and incubated at 30 °C for 24 h. The CFS was prepared by centrifugation the broth at 11500 rpm at 4 °C for 10 min. (Mini Spin, Eppendorf, AG 22331, Hamburg). Then, the supernatant of the LAB isolates were filtrated using sterile filtered (0.45 µm-pore-size filter, Millipore) (Ogunbanwo, 2005), and this filtrate was utilized for analysis.

Effect of heating of LAB-CFS on antifungal activity

LAB-CFS heat treatment was done at 90 °C and 121°C for 30 min and was continuously cooled in ice water. The supernatant were tested against *Candida* spp. which are *C. glabrata* ATCC 2001, and *C. krusei* ATCC 6258 with a microtiter plate assay as done by Muhialdin *et al.* (2011). Initially, *Candida* 10⁴ cell/mL was added to the prepared SDB. Next, addition of 100 µL of Sabouraud dextrose broth (SDB, Oxoid CM147) containing 10⁴ CFU/mL *Candida* and 100 µL of CFS into microtiter plates wells. At that moment, 200 µL of *Candida* in SDB without adding CFS was utilized as positive control. The incubation of the plates were done at 30 °C for 24, 48 and 72 h. and the measurement of *Candida* spp.'s growth were measured using optical density (OD) at 560 nm with a micro Elisa auto reader (Model 680, BioRad). The analysis was done in duplication and mean was taken. The measurement of *Candida* spp. percentage growth was taken using the following equation:

$$\text{Percentage growth of } \textit{Candida} (\%) = \frac{(\text{OD}_{560 \text{ nm}} \text{ after } 24, 48 \text{ and } 72 \text{ h} - \text{OD}_{560 \text{ nm}} \text{ at } 0 \text{ h})}{\text{OD}_{560 \text{ nm}} \text{ at } 0 \text{ h}} \times 100$$

Effect of different pH on LAB-CFS antifungal activity

The CFS-LAB pH isolates was adjusted at pH 3, 5, 6, 7, and 9 using 0.1 N HCl and 0.1 N NaOH. The initial LAB isolates pH was 4.1, 3.8, 3.7, and 3.9 for isolates HS, HC, HH and HM, respectively. The pH accustomed CFS were tested against *Candida* spp. *C. glabrata* ATCC 2001 and *C. krusei* ATCC 6258 in microtiter plates as defined above. A 100 µL of SDB containing *Candida* 10⁴ cell/ mL and 100 µL of altered supernatant were added into the wells. Later, 200 µL of *Candida* in Sabouraud broth was utilized as positive control. The incubation of the plates were at 30 °C for 24, 48 and 72 h. *Candida* growth was monitored at 24, 48, 72 h, respectively. *Candida* spp. growth percentage was measured utilizing the similar formula stated earlier.

Effect of enzymes on antifungal activity of LAB CFS

CFS proteinaceous evaluation was tested to measure their sensitivity to proteolytic enzymes proteinase K and RNase II minus the pH being adjusted. The CFS were established with enzymes proteinase K and RNase II

independently (Aween *et al.*, 2012). First, one μL of respective enzyme were mixed into three mL of supernatant and were left 1 h at room temperature 28 ± 2 °C. Subsequently, the supernatant was tested against *Candida* spp. in microtiter plates as described above. Individual wells were injected with 100 μL of SDB that contains 10^4 cell/mL and 100 μL of supernatant with enzyme. Next, 200 μL of *Candida* in Sabouraud Broth was utilized as a positive control. The incubation of the plates was at 30 °C for 72 h. *Candida* growth was observed at 24, 48, and 72 h, respectively using optical density at 560 nm. The experiments were carried out in duplicate. *Candida* growth percentage was measured using the similar formula stated earlier.

Identification of LAB isolates by API 50 CH and 16S rDNA

The LAB isolates that show antifungal activity were identified using API 50 CHL kit assay as described by the manufacturer (Tamminen *et al.*, 2004). The LAB isolates were identified using 16S rDNA gene sequences. The genomic DNA LAB of were extracted using Wizard® Genomic Gram-positive DNA purification kit (USA). The genomic DNA was amplified using polymerase chain reaction (PCR) by utilising the Fail Safe™ Pre Mix kit Epicentre® (an Illumina® company). A 1400 bp fragment of 16S rDNA gene was amplified using PCR with primers based on 16S forward (5-AGAGTTTGATCCTGGCTC-3) and 16S reverse (5-CGGGAACGTATTCAC-CG-3) regions (Magnusson *et al.*, 2003). The PCR protocols were done as follows: denaturation at 95 °C for 2 min, followed by 35 denaturation cycles at 92 °C for 45 sec, annealing at 54 °C for 1 min and elongation at 72 °C for 1 min, and final extension at 72 °C for 5 min. Next, 5 μL of each amplified mixture were exposed to electrophoresis in 1.5% (1.5 g agarose powder with 100 mL in 1 x TEA buffer) for 45 min at 90 volts. Amplified products were sent for sequencing to the First BASE Laboratories Sdn Bhd., Malaysia. The aligned nucleotide sequence was analyzed to the Nucleotide-nucleotide Basic Local Alignment Search Tool (BLASTN) software version 2.2.14 and was compared to other accessible isolates in the Gen Bank Database of the National Centre for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) to be confirmed.

Statistical analyses

All data were presented as mean \pm standard deviation and were analyzed using one-way analysis of variance

(ANOVA) for heat treatments, and two-way ANOVA for pH treatments using general linear model (GLM) procedure of SAS. Tukey's test was applied for significant means at $p < 0.05$ to evaluate the significant differences between groups. Data with zero values were transformed using root square plus one and analyzed, whereas the real values were presented.

RESULTS

Ten honey samples from fifteen were positive for LAB. The identification of four LAB isolated from honey samples that showed antifungal activity against pathogenic *Candida* spp. is presented in (Table 1). The results from API 50 CHL kit identified the LAB isolate HS from Al-Sedar honey as *Lactobacillus plantarum*2, and other three isolates of LAB HH from Al-Hanon honey, HC from Tualang honey and HM from Al-Maray were identified as *L. curvatus*. However, the results from 16S rDNA sequence were slightly different: HS was identified as *L. plantarum*, HH as *L. curvatus*, HC as *Pediococcus acidilactici* and HM as *P. pentosaceus*.

Effect of heating LAB CFS on antifungal activity

Heating the CFS of LAB (HS, HC, HH and HM) at 90 °C and 121 °C for 30 min resulted in the growth reduction of all the *Candida* spp. compared to the control after 24 h incubation (Tables 2, 3, 4 and 5). Especially the growth of *C. glabrata* ATCC 2001 was significant ($p < 0.001$) completely inhibited by the heated CFS of *L. curvatus* HH and *P. pentosaceus* HM with incubation 72 h at 90 °C and 121 °C (Table 2 and 3). Likewise, the growth of *C. krusei* ATCC 6258 was significant ($p < 0.001$) completely inhibited by the heated CFS of HH at 121 °C with 72 h incubation (Table 5).

Effect of different pH on LAB-CFS antifungal activity

The antifungal activity of CFS was observed at pH 3 to 5 but it was decreased at pH 6. The CFS of LAB isolates showed inhibited the growth of all *Candida* spp. significantly ($p < 0.05$), especially the growth of *C. glabrata* ATCC 2001 was significant ($p < 0.001$) completely inhibited by CFS of *P. pentosaceus* HM at pH 3 and pH 5 compared to the control. However, CFS of *L. curvatus* HH lead to inhibit the growth of *C. glabrata* completely ($p < 0.001$) at pH 3 with incubation 24 h. The growth of *C. krusei* was reduced at pH 3 by CFS of *L. plantarum* HS and *P. acidilactici* HC. While, was significant ($p < 0.001$)

Table 1: Similarity index of LAB isolated from honey samples as determined by API 50CHL and 16S rDNA.

Sources	Code	API CHL 50	Similarity	16S rDNA	Similarity
Al-Sedar honey, Libya	HS	<i>L. plantarum</i> 2	99.4%	<i>L. plantarum</i>	99.0 %
Al-Hanon honey, Libya	HH	<i>L. curvatus</i>	99.4%	<i>L. curvatus</i>	96.0%
Tualang honey, Malaysia	HC	<i>L. curvatus</i>	99.4%	<i>Pediococcus acidilactici</i>	99.0%
Al-Maray honey, Yemen	HM	<i>L. curvatus</i>	97.4%	<i>Pediococcus pentosaceus</i>	99.0%

completely inhibited by *L. plantarum* HS at pH 5. The CFS of LAB HS and HM lost their antifungal activity especially against *C. krusei* ATCC6258 at pH 7.

Table 2: Percentage growth of *Candida glabrata* with LAB supernatant after heat treatment at 90 °C in microtiter plates incubation at 30 °C for 72 h*.

Isolates	Time (h)		
	24	48	72
HS	12.3 ± 0.45 ^b	38.7 ± .050 ^b	42.8 ± 0.96 ^b
HC	9.4 ± 0.51 ^c	20.0 ± 0.66 ^c	21.8 ± 0.55 ^c
HH	3.9 ± 0.26 ^d	0.00 ± 0.00 ^d	0.00 ± 0.00 ^d
HM	5.4 ± 0.35 ^d	0.00 ± 0.00 ^d	0.00 ± 0.00 ^d
Control	98.70 ± 1.53 ^a	100.4 ± 0.68 ^a	122.6 ± 1.35 ^a

*The results are expressed as mean ± standard deviations of values obtained from triplicate experiments.

^{a-e} Mean ± SD. Means with different superscripts in the same column differs significantly ($p < 0.05$).

Key: HS, *L. plantarum*; HC, *P. acidilactici*; HH, *L. curvatus*; HM, *P. pentosaceus*.

Table 3: Percentage growth of *Candida glabrata* with LAB supernatant after heat treatment at 121 °C in microtiter plates incubation at 30 °C for 72 h*.

Isolates	Time (h)		
	24	48	72
HS	23.0 ± 0.23 ^b	29.4 ± 0.85 ^b	38.4 ± 0.45 ^b
HC	18.6 ± 0.62 ^c	20.0 ± 0.83 ^d	30.8 ± 0.65 ^c
HH	23.0 ± 0.26 ^c	12.2 ± 0.15 ^d	0.00 ± 0.00 ^d
HM	10.4 ± 0.25 ^e	8.6 ± 0.51 ^e	0.00 ± 0.00 ^d
Control	114.5 ± 0.55 ^a	128.2 ± 0.70 ^a	144.2 ± 0.83 ^a

*The results are expressed as mean ± standard deviations of values obtained from triplicate experiments.

^{a-e} Mean ± SD. Means with different superscripts in the same column differs significantly ($p < 0.05$).

Key: HS, *L. plantarum*; HC, *P. acidilactici*; HH, *L. curvatus*; HM, *P. pentosaceus*.

Table 4: Percentage growth of *Candida krusei* with LAB supernatant after heat treatment at 90 °C in microtiter plates incubation at 30 °C for 72 h*.

Isolates	Time (h)		
	24	48	72
HS	20.6 ± 0.85 ^b	24.2 ± 0.20 ^b	32.3 ± 0.73 ^b
HC	16.0 ± 0.15 ^c	22.6 ± 0.36 ^c	33.7 ± 0.45 ^b
HH	14.7 ± 0.41 ^d	19.3 ± 0.35 ^d	24.6 ± 0.25 ^c
HM	10.4 ± 0.26 ^e	13.2 ± 0.15 ^e	22.7 ± 0.52 ^c
Control	89.4 ± 0.50 ^a	124.0 ± 0.50 ^a	156.0 ± 2.51 ^a

*The results are expressed as mean ± standard deviations of values obtained from triplicate experiments.

^{a-e} Mean ± SD. Means with different superscripts in the same column differs significantly ($p < 0.05$).

Key: HS, *L. plantarum*; HC, *P. acidilactici*; HH, *L. curvatus*; HM, *P. pentosaceus*.

Table 5: Percentage growth of *Candida krusei* with LAB supernatant after heat treatment at 121 °C in microtiter plates incubation at 30 °C for 72 h*.

Isolates	Time (h)		
	24	48	72
HS	20.0 ± 0.55 ^c	23.2 ± 0.32 ^d	30.1 ± 0.15 ^c
HC	9.0 ± 0.15 ^e	26.6 ± 0.45 ^c	30.7 ± 0.55 ^c
HH	18.2 ± 0.20 ^d	9.7 ± 0.64 ^e	00.0 ± 0.61 ^d
HM	27.4 ± 0.35 ^b	33.8 ± 0.60 ^b	45.2 ± 0.37 ^b
Control	139 ± 0.64 ^a	165 ± 1.52 ^a	188 ± 0.57 ^a

*The results are expressed as mean ± standard deviations of values obtained from triplicate experiments.

^{a-e} Mean ± SD. Means with different superscripts in the same column differs significantly ($p < 0.05$).

Key: HS, *L. plantarum*; HC, *P. acidilactici*; HH, *L. curvatus*; HM, *P. pentosaceus*.

Effect of enzymes on antifungal activity of LAB CFS

The LAB supernatants tested with proteinase K and RNase II showed strong inhibitory activity against most *Candida* spp. compared to the control (Tables 6 and 7). The CFS of *L. plantarum* HS showed complete inhibition against *C. krusei* when treated with proteinase K after 48 h and 72 h incubation. As well as CFS of *L. curvatus* HH and *P. pentosaceus* HM showed complete inhibition against *C. glabrata* compared to the other isolates this indicate that these isolates did not have protein (Table 8). Otherwise, when treated the CFS with RNase II the CFS

of *P. pentosaceus* (HM) showed complete inhibition against *C. glabrata* compared to the other isolates and the control. However, the treated CFS with RNase II destroyed the antifungal activity of *P. acidilactici* HC and *L. curvatus* HH against all *Candida* spp. especially against *C. krusei* indicating that the CFS contained protein-like antifungal compounds therefore, show the increase in growth of *C. krusei* after 48 h and 72 h of incubation (Table 9). This observation suggests that addition proteinase K and RNase II to the CFS of LAB isolates enhanced the antifungal activity to some isolates against *Candida* spp.

Table 6: Percentage growth of *Candida* species with LAB supernatant after treatment with proteinase K in microtiter plate incubated at 30 °C for 72 h*.

<i>Candida</i> spp.	Time (h)	LAB				
		HS	HC	HH	HM	Control
<i>C. glabrata</i> ATCC 2001	24	2.4	13.8	NG	NG	235
	48	6.6	5.7	NG	NG	242
	72	17.3	4.3	NG	NG	267
<i>C. krusei</i> ATCC 6258	24	1.5	7.4	6.6	10.5	121.2
	48	NG	2.6	4.1	6.3	136.0
	72	NG	1.3	1.4	3.5	158.4

*The growth was measured as OD at 560 nm, NG: no growth.

Table 7: Percentage growth of *Candida* species with LAB supernatant after treatment with RNase II in microtiter plate incubated at 30 °C for 72h*.

<i>Candida</i> spp.	Time (h)	LAB				
		HS	HC	HH	HM	Control
<i>C. glabrata</i> ATCC 2001	24	9.5	3.6	NG	4.1	158.8
	48	9.0	8.7	9.3	NG	164.3
	72	5.7	14.7	16.6	NG	174.3
<i>C. krusei</i> ATCC 6258	24	19.7	45.6	20.8	22.6	126.6
	48	16.2	60.2	21.8	17.7	146.3
	72	13.6	103.5	28.4	11.4	151.2

*The growth was measured as OD at 560 nm, NG: no growth.

DISCUSSION

The isolation of LAB is possible from various sources and many reports were on the LAB antibacterial activity while there were fewer reports on LAB antifungal activity. LAB antimicrobial activity has been recognized to the creation of antimicrobial compounds with antifungal activities. This study observed that the four LAB isolated from honey samples supernatants (CFS), *L. plantarum* HS, *L. curvatus* HH, *P. acidilactici* HC and *P. pentosaceus* HM had good antifungal activity against pathogenic *Candida* spp. as assessed by the microtiter plates evaluation. This specifies that CFS from these LAB isolates comprise of compounds with protein-like nature. When the CFS was heated to 90 °C and 121 °C for 30 min resulted in significantly ($p < 0.05$) reduced the growth of the *Candida* spp. especially the growth of *C. glabrata* ATCC 2001 was significantly ($p < 0.001$) complete inhibited by the heated CFS of *L. curvatus* HH and *P. pentosaceus* HM as they were incubated 72 h at 90 °C and 121 °C (Tables 2 and 3). Additionally, the growth of *C. krusei* ATCC 6258 was

significantly ($p < 0.001$) complete inhibited by the heated CFS of HH at 121 °C with 72 h incubation (Table 5). Similarly, Monthon (2005) observed that antifungal activity of *Lactococcus lactis* isolated from fermented food was stable during heat treatment and retaining the activity was even after autoclaving at 121 °C for 15 min against *C. albicans* DMST 5239. Moreover, Oliveira *et al.* (2008) reported that CFS of LAB isolated from vacuum packaged beef had antimicrobial activity after heating 100 °C for 10 min. The antifungal activity was enhanced after heating might be due to bacteriocins which is characterized by high heat stability indicated that the antifungal compound produced by LAB strains is a bacteriocins. In this study, when the pH of the CFS was adjusted to different value 3, 5, 6 and 7 showed significantly ($p < 0.05$) reduced the growth of *Candida* spp. whereas, the growth of *C. glabrata* was higher significantly ($p < 0.001$) inhibited by CFS of *P. pentosaceus* HM at pH 3 and pH 5 as well, the growth of *C. krusei* was significantly ($p < 0.001$) completed inhibited by CFS of *L. plantarum* HS at pH 5. This may suggest that compounds were responsible for

Table 8: Percentage growth of *Candida glabrata* with LAB supernatant pH adjusted 3, 5, 6 and 7 in microtiter plate incubated at 30 °C for 72*.

pH	Isolates	Time (h)		
		24	48	72
pH 3	HS	1.7 ± 0.15 ^m	36.2 ± 0.21 ^g	31.0 ± 0.17 ^{ij}
	HC	3.7 ± 0.20 ^k	41.5 ± 3.22 ^e	41.5 ± 0.32 ^{fgh}
	HH	12.1 ± 1.05 ⁿ	9.3 ± 0.15 ^m	0.00 ± 0.00 ⁿ
	HM	13.1 ± 1.59 ⁱ	7.5 ± 0.72 ⁿ	0.00 ± 0.00 ⁿ
	Control	178 ± 2.51 ^a	198 ± 3.00 ^a	216 ± 2.08 ^a
pH 5	HS	17.5 ± 0.31 ^g	29.8 ± 0.40 ⁱ	43.5 ± 0.45 ^f
	HC	13.1 ± 0.26 ⁱ	43.5 ± 0.36 ^{jk}	55.9 ± 0.75 ^e
	HH	10.7 ± 0.43 ^j	33.9 ± 0.65 ^l	30.3 ± 0.70 ^j
	HM	15.9 ± 0.62 ⁿ	3.5 ± 0.92 ^k	0.00 ± 0.00 ⁿ
	Control	69.0 ± 0.91 ^b	96.0 ± 0.75 ^c	123 ± 0.68 ^b
pH 6	HS	13.0 ± 0.53 ⁱ	28.0 ± 1.05 ^j	35.0 ± 0.60 ^{hij}
	HC	26.8 ± 1.06 ^e	35.9 ± 0.25 ^{gⁿ}	45.3 ± 0.85 ^f
	HH	15.2 ± 0.75 ^h	34.5 ± 0.25 ^h	36.2 ± 1.24 ^{ghi}
	HM	19.3 ± 0.86 ^f	38.4 ± 0.73 ^f	46.1 ± 1.13 ^f
	Control	62.1 ± 1.70 ^c	78.5 ± 0.86 ^b	87.6 ± 0.83 ^c
pH 7	HS	10.7 ± 0.83 ^j	13.2 ± 0.72 ^l	26.2 ± 0.72 ^{mn}
	HC	11.4 ± 1.27 ^j	35.4 ± 0.73 ^{g^h}	46.2 ± 0.66 ^{fg}
	HH	3.3 ± 0.70 ^l	12.8 ± 0.55 ^k	16.3 ± 1.27 ^{lm}
	HM	17.6 ± 0.41 ^g	28.0 ± 0.64 ^l	30.3 ± 0.58 ^j
	Control	54.2 ± 0.66 ^d	66.0 ± 0.36 ^d	76.4 ± 1.12 ^d

*The results are expressed as mean ± standard deviations of values obtained from triplicate experiments.

^{a-n} Mean ± SD. Means with different superscripts in the same column differs significantly ($p < 0.05$). Growth was determined by measuring OD 560 nm.

Key: HS, *L. plantarum*; HC, *P. acidilactici*; HH, *L. curvatus*; HM, *P. pentosaceus*.

Table 9: Percentage growth of *Candida krusei* with LAB supernatant pH adjusted 3, 5, 6 and 7 in microtiter plate incubated at 30 °C for 72*.

pH	Isolates	Time (h)		
		24	48	72
pH 3	HS	6.8 ± 0.81 ^m	25.6 ± 0.83 ^k	37.9 ± 0.15 ⁿ
	HC	3.4 ± 0.44 ⁿ	33.4 ± 0.74 ^{ij}	42.7 ± 0.35 ^l
	HH	28.7 ± 0.58 ^g	55.0 ± 0.51 ^f	56.4 ± 1.24 ^l
	HM	23.3 ± 0.96 ^h	44.7 ± 0.66 ^g	53.2 ± 1.10 ^j
	Control	124.6 ± 1.04 ^a	154 ± 0.50 ^a	178 ± 0.23 ^a
pH 5	HS	0.00 ± 0.00 ^p	27.1 ± 0.89 ^k	37.3 ± 0.90 ^o
	HC	1.7 ± 0.26 ^o	31.2 ± 1.01 ^j	44.3 ± 0.47 ^k
	HH	1.6 ± 0.46 ^o	31.7 ± 1.41 ^j	40.0 ± 1.04 ^m
	HM	49.4 ± 1.18 ^d	80.4 ± 1.24 ^d	97.3 ± 0.25 ^g
	Control	102 ± 1.15 ^b	139.5 ± 1.35 ^b	169.8 ± 1.07 ^b
pH 6	HS	11.8 ± 0.89 ^l	32.8 ± 1.96 ^{ij}	36.8 ± 0.92 ^o
	HC	18.7 ± 0.47 ⁱ	34.7 ± 0.58 ⁱ	40.0 ± 1.01 ^m
	HH	28.4 ± 1.33 ^g	38.9 ± 1.50 ^h	38.7 ± 1.45 ⁿ
	HM	48.3 ± 1.27 ^d	53.4 ± 0.21 ^f	75.0 ± 1.17 ^h
	Control	89.2 ± 1.21 ^c	125 ± 1.10 ^c	137.4 ± 0.20 ^c
pH 7	HS	35.4 ± 1.53 ^f	60.9 ± 2.56 ^e	105 ± 0.30 ^f
	HC	17.0 ± 1.04 ^l	26.6 ± 1.28 ^k	45.0 ± 0.80 ^k
	HH	16.0 ± 0.83 ^k	21.3 ± 1.27 ^l	42.6 ± 1.11 ^l
	HM	35.6 ± 0.83 ^f	65.6 ± 0.32 ^e	112 ± 1.96 ^e
	Control	46.6 ± 1.58 ^e	77.5 ± 1.32 ^d	132 ± 1.62 ^d

*The results are expressed as mean ± standard deviations of values obtained from triplicate experiments.

^{a-n} Mean ± SD. Means with different superscripts in the same column differs significantly ($p < 0.05$). Growth was determined by measuring OD 560 nm.

Key: HS, *L. plantarum*; HC, *P. acidilactici*; HH, *L. curvatus*; HM, *P. pentosaceus*.

antifungal activity in CFS of these isolates are organic acids such as lactic acid and acetic acid. The CFS of LAB isolates lost their antifungal activity against *C. krusei* at pH 7 (Table 8 and 9). Sookkhee *et al.* (2001) reported that antifungal activity of CFS of *L. paracasei* subsp. (D6 and D14) and *L. rhamnosus* isolated from healthy oral cavity of Thai volunteers was more active at acidic pH than at alkali pH against *C. albicans* DTMU2. The CFS treated with enzymes proteinase K and RNase II results were different antifungal activity against *Candida* spp. The growth of *C. krusei* was completely inhibited by CFS of *L. plantarum* HS after treated with proteinase K. Likewise, the growth of *C. glabrata* was complete inhibition by CFS of *L. curvatus* HH and *P. pentosaceus* HM. On the contrary, treating CFS with RNase II destroyed the antifungal activity of *P. acidilactici* HC and *L. curvatus* HH against *Candida* spp. especially against *C. krusei* indicating that the CFS contained protein-like antifungal compounds. Similarly, Ndagano *et al.* (2011) reported that treatment of supernatant of LAB isolated from Mill flour and fermented cassava by enzymes such as pepsine, proteinase K and α chymotrypsin showed antifungal activity. We observed that the antifungal activity in the cell free supernatants of LAB was enhanced after treatment with proteolytic enzymes (proteinase K and RNase II), suggesting that the antifungal compound could be not protein. The results obtained from present study are in agreement with (Ronnqvist *et al.*, 2007) who reported that *L. fermentum* Ess-1 isolated from human showed activity against *C. albicans* and *C. glabrata*. Adeniyi and Damsa, (2013) reported that the CFS produced by *L. plantarum* isolated from salad vegetables showed higher antifungal activity against *C. albicans* ATCC 90029 with inhibition zone 25 mm. Recently, Parolin *et al.* (2015) reported that supernatants of *L. crispatus* BC1, BC4, BC5 and *L. vaginalis* BC15 isolated from vaginal healthy woman had antifungal activity against strains of *C. albicans* and *C. lusitaniae*.

CONCLUSION

This study demonstrated that LAB isolated from honey have antifungal activity against pathogenic *Candida* spp. Supernatants produced by LAB isolates were active in pH 3 to 5 and their antifungal activity enhanced after heating the supernatants to 90 and 121 °C, and after treatment with proteinase K and RNase II. This indicated that the supernatant contains compounds which can be used to inhibit growth of the pathogenic *Candida* spp. infections.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The researchers would like to thank the Faculty of Science and Technology, Universiti Sains Islam Malaysia for making this work possible.

REFERENCES

- Adeniyi, B. and Damsa, I. (2013). Antifungal capacity of lactic acid bacteria isolated from salad vegetables. *African Journal of Biomedical Research* **14**, 137-141.
- Aween, M. M., Hassan, Z., Muhialdin, B. J., Noor, H. M. and Eljamel, Y. A. (2012). Evaluation on antibacterial activity of *Lactobacillus acidophilus* strains isolated from honey. *American Journal of Applied Sciences* **9**, 807- 817.
- Bulgasem, B. Y., Hassan, Z., Abdalsadig, N. K. A., Yousoff, W. M. W., Musa, E. M. T. and Lani, M. N. (2015). Anti-adhesion activity of lactic acid bacteria supernatant against human pathogenic *Candida* species biofilm. *Health Science Journal* **9**, 1-9.
- Dalié, D., Deschamps, A. and Richard-Forget, F. (2010). Lactic acid bacteria–Potential for control of mould growth and mycotoxins: A review. *Food Control* **21**, 370-380.
- De Man, J., Rogosa, D. and Sharpe, M. E. (1960). A medium for the cultivation of *Lactobacilli*. *Journal of Applied Bacteriology* **23**, 130-135.
- Delavenne, E., Mounier, J., Déniel, F., Barbier, G. and Le Blay, G. (2012). Biodiversity of antifungal lactic acid bacteria isolated from raw milk samples from cow, ewe and goat over one-year period. *International Journal of Food Microbiology* **155**, 185-190.
- De Vuyst, L. and Leroy, F. (2007). Bacteriocins from lactic acid bacteria: Production, purification, and food applications. *Journal of Molecular Microbiology and Biotechnology* **13**, 194-199.
- Eva, R., Arqués, J. L., Rodríguez, R., Ángela, P., Landete, M. J. and Medina, M. (2012). Antimicrobial properties of probiotic strains isolated from breast-fed infants. *Journal of Functional Foods* **4**, 542-551.
- Fitzsimmons, N. and Berry, D. (1993). Inhibition of *Candida albicans* by *Lactobacillus acidophilus*: Evidence for the involvement of a peroxidase system. *Microbios* **80**, 125-133.
- Gerez, C. L., Torino, M. I., Rollán, G. and Font de Valdez, G. (2009). Prevention of bread mould spoilage by using lactic acid bacteria with antifungal properties. *Food Control* **20**, 144-148.
- Guillot, N. (1958). Elaboration par *Lactobacillus acidophilus* d'un produit actif contre *Candida albicans*. *Annales de l'Institut Pasteur / Microbiologie* **95**, 194-207.
- Karipatas, E., Tulumoglu, Ş. and Erdem, B. (2010). Antifungal effects of *Lactobacillus* spp. bacteria on *Candida* yeast. *Oncology* **2**, 1.
- Lavermicocca, P., Valerio, F. and Visconti, A. (2003). Antifungal activity of phenyllactic acid against molds isolated from bakery products. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* **69**, 634-640.
- Magnusson, J. and Schnürer, J. (2001). *Lactobacillus coryniformis* subsp. *coryniformis* strain Si3 produces a broad-spectrum proteinaceous antifungal compound. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* **67**, 1-5.
- Magnusson, J., Ström, K., Roos, S., Sjögren, J. and Schnürer, J. (2003). Broad and complex antifungal

- activity among environmental isolates of lactic acid bacteria. *FEMS Microbiology Letters* **219**, 129-135.
- Messens, W. and De Vuyst, L. (2002).** Inhibitory substances produced by *Lactobacilli* isolated from sourdoughs - a review. *International Journal of Food Microbiology* **72**, 31-43.
- Monthon. (2005).** Isolation and selection of anti-*Candida albicans* producing lactic acid bacteria. *Walailak Journal Science and Technology* **2**, 179-187.
- Muhialdin, B. J., Hassan, Z., Sadon, S. K., Zulkifli, N. A. and Azfar, A. (2011).** Effect of pH and heat treatment on antifungal activity of *Lactobacillus fermentum* Te007, *Lactobacillus pentosus* G004 and *Pediococcus pentosaceus* Te010. *Innovative Romanian Food Biotechnology* **8**, 41-53.
- Ndagano, D., Lamoureux, T., Dortu, C., Vandermoten, S. and Thonart, P. (2011).** Antifungal activity of 2 lactic acid bacteria of the *Weissella* genus isolated from food. *Journal of Food Science* **76**, 305-311.
- Ogunbanwo, S. T. (2005).** Functional properties of lactic acid bacteria isolated from ogi and fufu, two Nigerian fermented foods. *Advances in Food Sciences* **27**, 14-21.
- Oliveira, R. B., Oliveira, A. D. L. and Glória, M. B. A. (2008).** Screening of lactic acid bacteria from vacuum packaged beef for antimicrobial activity. *Brazilian Journal of Microbiology* **39**, 368-374.
- Parolin, C., Marangoni, A., Laghi, L., Foschi, C., Palomino, R. A. N., Calonghi, N., Cevenini, R. and Vitali. (2015).** Isolation of vaginal lactobacilli and characterization of anti-*Candida* activity. *PLoS One* **10**, e0131220.
- Rebecca, A. O., Mobolaji, B. O. and Janet, O. O. (2008).** Production and characterization of antimicrobial agents by lactic acid bacteria isolated from fermented foods. *The Internet Journal of Microbiology* **4**, 1-7.
- Ronnqvist, D., Forsgren-Brusk, U., Husmark, U. and Grahn-Hakansson, E. (2007).** *Lactobacillus fermentum* Ess-1 with unique growth inhibition of vulvo-vaginal candidiasis pathogens. *Journal Medical Microbiology* **56**, 1500-1504.
- Sathe, S., Nawani, N., Dhakephalkar, P. and Kapadnis, B. (2007).** Antifungal lactic acid bacteria with potential to prolong shelf-life of fresh vegetables. *Journal of Applied Microbiology* **103**, 2622-2628.
- Sookkhee, S., Chulasiri, M and Prachyabrued, W. (2001).** Lactic acid bacteria from healthy oral cavity of Thai volunteers: Inhibition of oral pathogens. *Journal of Applied Microbiology* **90**, 172-179.
- Strom, K., Schnürer, J. and Melin, P. (2005).** Co-cultivation of antifungal *Lactobacillus plantarum* MiLAB 393 and *Aspergillus nidulans*, evaluation of effects on fungal growth and protein expression. *FEMS Microbiology Letters* **246**, 119-124.
- Strus, M., Kucharska, A., Kukla, G., Brzychczy-Włoch, M., Maresz, K. and Heczko, P. B. (2005).** The *in vitro* activity of vaginal *Lactobacillus* with probiotic properties against *Candida*. *Infectious Diseases in Obstetrics and Gynecology* **13**, 69-75.
- Tamminen, M., Joutsjoki, T., Sjöblom, M., Joutsen, M., Palva, A., Ryhänen, E. L. and Joutsjoki, V. (2004).** Screening of lactic acid bacteria from fermented vegetables by carbohydrate profiling and PCR-ELISA. *Letters in Applied Microbiology* **39**, 439-444.
- Valerio, F., De Bellis, P., Lonigro, S. L., Viscconti, A. and Lavermicocca, P. (2008).** Use of *Lactobacillus plantarum* fermentation products in bread-making to prevent *Bacillus subtilis* rosy spoilage. *International Journal of Food Microbiology* **122**, 328-332.